2018 - 2019
Annual Performance Report

Key Performance Indicators
Ending March 31, 2019
MISSION STATEMENT

To enhance the quality of life of residents and visitors by providing the highest level of safe, clean, affordable responsive and reliable public transportation through a coordinated and convenient bus and rail system.
# Table of Contents

## Introduction
- About Us ..................................................................................................................... 3
- Transit Peer Benchmarking .......................................................................................... 4

## Service Delivery
- Ridership .................................................................................................................... 5
- Performance .................................................................................................................. 7
- On-Time Performance ................................................................................................. 8
- Route Performance Analysis ....................................................................................... 11
- Mileage Efficiency .................................................................................................... 17

## Fleet
- Reliability .................................................................................................................. 19
- Performance .............................................................................................................. 21
- Vehicle Profile .......................................................................................................... 22
- Vehicle Maintenance ................................................................................................. 25

## Paratransit
- Ridership ................................................................................................................... 27
- Registrations ............................................................................................................... 29
- Eligibility Types ......................................................................................................... 30
- Trip Types .................................................................................................................. 30
- Ridership Makeup ..................................................................................................... 31
- Trip Delivery .............................................................................................................. 31

## Customer Relations
- Customer Care Department ....................................................................................... 33
- Call Center Activity ................................................................................................... 34
- Social Media .............................................................................................................. 36
- Digital Communication ............................................................................................... 37
- metro.nfta.com .......................................................................................................... 38
- Customer Commendations & Complaints ................................................................. 42
- Customer Complaints by Type .................................................................................. 43
- Customer Complaints by Station ............................................................................. 44
- Customer Satisfaction Surveys .................................................................................. 45

## Financial
- Revenue .................................................................................................................... 53
- Expenses .................................................................................................................... 55
- Metro Pass Sales ....................................................................................................... 56
- Fuel Costs .................................................................................................................. 58
- Personnel ................................................................................................................... 59

## Safety / Environment
- Collisions .................................................................................................................. 61
- Workplace ................................................................................................................... 63
- Carbon Footprint ....................................................................................................... 65

## Our Future
- What does the future hold? ....................................................................................... 66
ABOUT US

NFTA-Metro (Metro) is proud to serve approximately 24 million people each year in Erie and Niagara Counties. The more than 1,000 Metro employees made up of operators, planners, mechanics, technicians and specialists responsible for delivering service, work diligently to make it easy for our customers to experience the highest level of public transportation. A big part of our commitment to our community is transparency and continuous improvements, and that is why our Annual Performance Report is important.

As a public agency, NFTA-Metro is accountable to the people we serve. We want to make it easy for our customers and stakeholders to understand and review our performance. Measuring the performance of a transit system is the first step toward efficient and proactive management. The use of performance measures for transportation planning and operations is critical for transportation agencies who are managing evolving demands with diminishing resources.

This annual performance report provides a summary of the performance metrics that Metro monitors to keep the system efficient, economical, safe, and reliable while pursuing continued improvement. Most of the representations compare data for either four or five fiscal years. It is Metro's intent to use these metrics to provide a look back at where we have been as well as provide a roadmap to the future. This report is updated annually and may introduce new performance measures to expand our ability to evaluate our efforts and keep our review relevant.
Introduction

TRANSIT PEER BENCHMARKING GROUPS
NFTA-Metro is a member of both the American Bus Benchmarking Group (ABBG) and the Group of North American Light Rail Systems (GOAL). Participation in these Groups provides Metro with benchmarking capabilities within our bus, rail and paratransit operations to evaluate our performance and identify opportunities for improvement. The ABBG was established in 2011 and GOAL in 2015 which are headquartered at Imperial College, London, England. It is comprised of over 30 public transit agencies providing transit service throughout the United States and Canada.

The significance of membership in the benchmarking Groups includes developing concise, well-balanced and comparable performance measures, identifying underlying trends and sharing best practices, publishing annual reports and tools. Benchmarking is not merely a comparison of data or a creation of rankings. The structured Key Performance Indicators (KPI) comparisons can be used for:

- Stimulating productive “why” questions
- Identifying lines of further inquiry (e.g. via website forum or clearinghouse studies)
- Identifying high priority problems, strengths and weaknesses
- Monitoring trends by analyzing performance over time, allowing the identification of organizations which have truly improved
- Internal motivation – identifying and setting achievable targets for improved performance
- Supporting dialogue with government, authorities, media and other stakeholders (confidentiality permitting)

Throughout this report you will find ABBG benchmarking results outlined in black. The comparable NFTA-Metro data is highlighted in yellow and shows our ranking among the other members of the Peer Group as well as our yearly progression in the CSS.
RIDERSHIP
Reported Metro ridership is based on data collected through a Federal Transit Administration (FTA) approved sampling program and on-vehicle technology.

Bus Ridership

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>FYE 2015</th>
<th>FYE 2016</th>
<th>FYE 2017</th>
<th>FYE 2018</th>
<th>FYE 2019</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>21,714,180</td>
<td>22,680,510</td>
<td>21,602,535</td>
<td>20,434,993</td>
<td>19,282,797</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Rail Ridership

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>FYE 2015</th>
<th>FYE 2016</th>
<th>FYE 2017</th>
<th>FYE 2018</th>
<th>FYE 2019</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4,407,968</td>
<td>5,212,083</td>
<td>4,695,638</td>
<td>4,518,285</td>
<td>4,485,084</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

System Ridership

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>FYE 2015</th>
<th>FYE 2016</th>
<th>FYE 2017</th>
<th>FYE 2018</th>
<th>FYE 2019</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>26,301,333</td>
<td>28,079,525</td>
<td>26,501,597</td>
<td>25,158,939</td>
<td>23,982,394</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
PERFORMANCE
Passengers per vehicle mile and hour is a measurement of service efficiency. Metro pursues improved operating efficiency by attracting additional riders, maximizing route design and operating an efficient fleet.

This chart represents Metro’s standing relative to other members in the American Bus Benchmarking Group.
ON-TIME PERFORMANCE
Metro monitors the efficiency of the service it provides. Metro “On-Time Performance” is the calculated difference between the actual time a Metro vehicle encounters a specific stop compared to the time that vehicle was scheduled to be there.

ON-TIME CALCULATION

Metro Bus
The window for Metro Bus on-time is six minutes. An arrival is considered on time if it is less than two minutes early and less than four minutes late. Late arrivals can be affected by weather conditions, street conditions, boarding/alighting patterns or traffic along the route.

Metro Rail
The window for Metro Rail on-time is one minute.
ON-TIME PERFORMANCE - FIXED ROUTE

Daily On-Time - Metro Bus

- Weekday: 83.8%
- Saturday: 83.6%
- Sunday: 83.4%

Hourly On-Time - Metro Bus

NFTA-METRO
Early arrivals are the portion of non-compliant arrivals that can be improved through management and technology enhancements and are less related to external factors.
ROUTE PERFORMANCE ANALYSIS – WEEKDAY SERVICE ONLY
Metro Service Delivery and Evaluation Guidelines have been established to provide an objective basis for assessing the performance of existing Metro Bus service. Routes are grouped by type or characteristics of service and evaluated to provide the basis for developing service adjustments.

Passengers per Revenue Hour
This represents the productivity of the route by the number of passengers carried for each hour of revenue service provided. It is computed by dividing the number of average weekday riders by the associated number of revenue hours of service for each route.

Primary/Core Routes
Passengers per Revenue Hour

![Bar chart showing passenger per revenue hour for various routes. The chart compares FYE 2019 and FYE 2018. The routes are 3 Grant, 4 Broadway, 5 Niagara-Kenmore, 6 Sycamore, 12 Utica, 13 Kensington, 10 Bailey, 20 Elmwood, 23 Fiftieth-More-Hertfi, 24 Genesee, 25 Delaware, 26 DFI Evan, 32 Amherst, and 35 Pin Ave. The chart highlights the performance of each route.]
ROUTE PERFORMANCE ANALYSIS – WEEKDAY SERVICE ONLY

**Secondary Routes**

*Passengers per Revenue Hour*

1. William
2. Clinton
3. Baynes-Richmond
4. Main
5. Calvin
6. Abbott
7. Seneca
8. South Park
9. Jefferson
10. Porter-Best
11. Wohlers
12. N.F. Blvd.
13. Sheridan
14. Lackawanna
15. Lockport
16. Lancaster
17. Youngs Rd.
18. Williamsville
19. Millard-Suburban
20. Main Niagara
21. Hydf Park
22. Military

**FYE 2019 & FYE 2018**
ROUTE PERFORMANCE ANALYSIS – WEEKDAY SERVICE ONLY

Collector Express Routes
Passengers per Revenue Hour

Limited Express Routes
Passengers per Revenue Hour
ROUTE PERFORMANCE ANALYSIS – WEEKDAY SERVICE ONLY

Farebox Recovery
This represents the percent of operating expenses which are directly covered by the passenger fares. It is computed by dividing the total passenger fare revenue by the total operating expenses for each route.

![Primary/Core Routes](chart)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Route Code</th>
<th>FYE 2019</th>
<th>FYE 2018</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3 GRANT</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 BROADWAY</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 NIAGARA KENMORE</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6 SYCAMORE</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12 UTICA</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13 KENSINGTON</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19 DAILEY</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20 FIMWOOD</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23 FILLMORE-HERTEL</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24-GENESEE</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25 DELAWARE</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26 DELEVAN</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32 AMHERST</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>55 PINE AVE</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
ROUTE PERFORMANCE ANALYSIS – WEEKDAY SERVICE ONLY

Farebox Recovery

Secondary Routes

Farebox Recovery

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Route</th>
<th>FYE 2019</th>
<th>FYE 2018</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 WILLIAM</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 CHITTY</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7 RAYNS-RICHMOND</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8 MAIZE</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11 CULVIN</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14 ABBOTT</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15 SENECA</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16 SOUTH PARK</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18 JEFFERSON</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22 PORTER-BLST</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29 WOHLERS</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>34 N.F. BLVD</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35 SHFIRIDAN</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>42 LACKAWANNA</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>44 LUCKOPKI</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>46 LANCASTER</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>47 YOUNGS RD</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>48 WILLIAMSVILLE</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>49 MILLARD-SUBURBAN</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>50 MAIN-NIAGARA</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>52 HYDE PARK</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>54 MILITARY</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
ROUTE PERFORMANCE ANALYSIS – WEEKDAY SERVICE ONLY

Farebox Recovery

**Collector Express Routes**

- 40 GRAND ISLAND
- 61 N. TONAWANDA
- 66 WILLIAMSVILLE
- 67 CLEVELAND HILL
- 68 GEO URBAN
- 69 ALDEN
- 70 FAST AURORA
- 72 ORCHARD PARK
- 74 HAMBURG
- 75 WEST SLEIGH
- 76 LOTUS BAY
- 79 TONAWANDA

**Limited Express Routes**

- 60 NIAGARA FALLS
- 61 LOCKPORT
- 704 AIRPORT

---

NFTA-METRO
MILEAGE EFFICIENCY
Mileage efficiency compares the amount of vehicle miles traveled providing revenue generating service (REV miles) with the miles traveled when the vehicle is out of service (deadhead miles). This measure reflects route design efficiency.

Metro Bus - Percent of Deadhead Miles

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>FYE 2015</th>
<th>FYE 2016</th>
<th>FYE 2017</th>
<th>FYE 2018</th>
<th>FYE 2019</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Rev Miles 8,503,049</td>
<td>Rev Miles 8,437,553</td>
<td>Rev Miles 8,537,048</td>
<td>Rev Miles 8,425,000</td>
<td>Rev Miles 8,432,832</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19.4%</td>
<td>19.1%</td>
<td>19.1%</td>
<td>18.8%</td>
<td>18.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D/H Miles -2,044,810</td>
<td>D/H Miles -1,994,394</td>
<td>D/H Miles -2,021,594</td>
<td>D/H Miles -1,954,096</td>
<td>D/H Miles -1,822,087</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

ABBG 2017 Data - Percent Deadhead Miles (Indexed to Group Average = 1.0)
Metro Rail mileage efficiency is maintained in excess of 87%.
RELIABILITY

Metro’s bus fleet consists of primarily 40’ buses with diesel, hybrid (diesel/electric) or CNG power. The PAL fleet is comprised of vans powered by diesel, gasoline or CNG. Vehicle performance has a direct impact on Metro’s ability to deliver reliable, safe service. Measurement of fleet reliability and efficiency demonstrates the effectiveness of Metro’s maintenance program.

Occasionally mechanical defects necessitate removing a vehicle from service. Miles without Service Interruptions reflects how many miles a bus has traveled in service before either a bus does not complete its scheduled trip or is unable to start its next scheduled trip.
RELIABILITY

Mileage Without Service Interruptions

- SYSTEM:
  - FYE 2015: 8,570
  - FYE 2016: 7,882
- Diesel Bus:
  - FYE 2015: 8,056
  - FYE 2016: 8,195
- Hybrid Bus:
  - FYE 2015: 9,950
  - FYE 2016: 8,954
- CNG Bus:
  - FYE 2015: 19,720
  - FYE 2016: 16,928
  - FYE 2019: 54,228
- Van:
  - FYE 2015: 64,097
PERFORMANCE
Fuel economy is directly related to the state of good repair and technological innovation of the bus fleet and is impacted by both maintenance and fleet age.
VEHICLE PROFILE
An underlying factor to the vehicle reliability is the overall age and mileage of the vehicle. The Federal Transit Administration (FTA), which provides the major portion of funding for vehicle purchase, has prescribed the useful life of a 40’ bus as 12 years of revenue service and/or 500,000 miles and useful life of a rail car as 30 years with a 15-year life for a rebuild. The rail car fleet continues to undergo complete car rebuilding.
VEHICLE PROFILE

Average Miles per Bus

- FYE 2015
- FYE 2016
- FYE 2017
- FYE 2018
- FYE 2019

Miles 340,025
Miles 350,075
VEHICLE PROFILE
Based on the prescribed useful life/miles milestones, a portion of the bus fleet is in need of replacement. The Federal Transit Administration identifies the useful life of a bus at 12 years and the useful mileage at 500,000 miles.

Buses Beyond Useful Age

Buses Beyond Useful Miles

Fleet
VEHICLE MAINTENANCE

Buses out of service are undergoing repair of defects and are not available for revenue service. Buses out of service include mechanical defects, vehicle corrosion and collision related maintenance and repair requirements.
VEHICLE MAINTENANCE
Fleet defects are tracked to identify specific problem needs for both training and systemic areas of concern for bus maintenance. Fleet defects are directly related to preventative maintenance and vehicle age and mileage. A comprehensive training program is mandatory to improve vehicle reliability and maintain performance of an aging fleet. Vehicle maintenance training is provided to address specific elements of the fleet to pursue improvements in fleet performance and reliability.
RIDERSHIP
Metro has a fully accessible bus and rail system. For those passengers who cannot access our regular Metro Bus and Rail due to a disability (temporary or permanent) we provide safe, reliable origin to destination transportation services through the Paratransit Access Line (PAL). Growth rates of PAL continue to strain the capacity of this service demanding improvements in operating efficiency and core capacity.

In an effort to minimize demand for PAL service, Metro continues to allow PAL eligible riders to use fixed route service free of charge.
REGISTRATIONS
Paratransit ridership is comprised of passengers who have obtained eligibility by completing the application process (eligible riders). Eligibility to use PAL is determined based on the guidelines contained in the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990.

Active Eligible Riders

New Eligible Rider Registrations
ELIGIBILITY TYPES
Access to PAL service is established through the application process when conditions may be applied to eligibility:

- Unconditional eligibility entitles an ADA rider to unlimited PAL service
- Conditional eligibility places restrictions on use of PAL service based on disability. (For example, the ADA rider may only be eligible to use PAL service during winter months or for travel to unfamiliar destinations where they have not been travel trained.)

TRIP TYPES
Trip bookings are classified as either casual or subscription trips. Casual, single trips are non-recurring trips made by an eligible rider. Subscription trips are trips requested between the same origin and destination on fixed days at fixed times.
RIDERSHIP MAKEUP

Eligible riders, who require assistance, may request to travel with a Personal Care Attendant (PCA) who rides free of charge (non-rev). Eligible riders are also permitted to travel with a companion who rides for the same fare as the eligible rider (rev).

TRIP DELIVERY

Trip delivery is based on trips scheduled for ADA eligible riders.
**Paratransit**

**TRIP DELIVERY**
Undelivered trips include:

**No Show (1.3%)**
The Metro vehicle arrived within 30 minute pickup window and waited at least five minutes but the rider did not board.

**Late Cancel (0.9%)**
Rider called to cancel a trip less than two hours prior to the scheduled pickup window.

**Missed Trip (0.1%)**
The Metro vehicle arrived outside the pickup window and the rider found other means of transportation or did not travel.

![Undelivered Trip Performance](chart.png)

- **No Show**: FYE 2015 - 2696, FYE 2016 - 3131
- **Late Cancel**: FYE 2015 - 1948, FYE 2018 - 1812
- **Missed**: FYE 2019 - 104, FYE 2017 - 316
CUSTOMER CARE DEPARTMENT

The Customer Care Team is the first point of contact for customers seeking information on services. They handle all inquiries for information on all Metro Bus and Rail routes, schedules, trip planning, service disruptions and delivery issues for both bus and rail.

In assisting customers, critical information obtained from both internal and external sources is utilized along with state-of-the-art customer service systems.
CALL CENTER ACTIVITY

Customer input is a critical element of providing quality public transit service. In order to provide opportunities for our customers to engage Metro, our Customer Care response line, (716) 855-7211, is utilized.

Our online InfoWeb, introduced in 2015, greatly improved our customers’ ability to access transit information. Customer calls are initially answered by an Interactive Voice Response (IVR) system with an automated message directing the caller to select an option which usually takes about 15 seconds (introduction time). This allows the caller to get standard information quickly (IVR answered).

Through the introduction of the InfoWeb and IVR Systems, the distribution of incoming calls has migrated to the new technology. This migration allows callers to gain access to more information in a timely fashion enhancing the customer experience.
CALL CENTER ACTIVITY

If the need arises for more specific information, the caller can then transfer to a Customer Care Agent (Agent Answered) for assistance. Once the caller requests agent contact, the average wait time reflects the time until the agent engages the caller. Once an agent is engaged, the actual conversation is measured as talk time.

![Agent Answered Timing](image-url)

- **Avg Wait Time (min:sec):**
  - FYE 2015: 0:06
  - FYE 2016: 0:06
  - FYE 2017: 1:26
  - FYE 2018: 1:28
  - FYE 2019: 1:28

- **Avg Talk Time (min:sec):**
  - FYE 2015: 0:06
  - FYE 2016: 0:06
  - FYE 2017: 1:26
  - FYE 2018: 1:28
  - FYE 2019: 1:28
SOCIAL MEDIA
Social media is a critical tool in NFTA-Metro’s continuing effort to inform, educate and engage our riders. Our social media channels and website allow NFTA-Metro to reach our riders with instant information. Our digital communications provide people with the opportunity to share relevant feedback and timely information, a on NFTA-Metro activities and services.

Inform          Educate

Engage

We are active on Facebook, Twitter, Instagram, LinkedIn and YouTube.
DIGITAL COMMUNICATION

On our website, Metro provides a tool kit for our customers.

The tool kit is available on a variety of electronic devices. Included in this tool kit is “Where’s My Bus” which tells prospective riders when they can expect a bus will arrive at a specific time and location, in real time.

When our riders want to get from point A to point B, they can use the “Trip Planner”. This will provide information for future travel plans including where and when to board, how long the trip will take and when to get off for your destination.

Riders can also get text messages or emails about Metro Bus and Rail Service when they need them by subscribing to Metro Instant Updates.

Metro customers can search on line for various types of travel information using FaceBook, Twitter, YouTube or Instagram. They can also go to metro.nfta.com.
metro.nfta.com

This chart tracks the average number of metro.nfta.com visitors, by day, by month. If the same person visits two or three times during the day, they are only counted once.
This chart depicts the number of addresses registered to receive Metro’s Instant Updates. They are counted by email and mobile subscriptions. Some clients may choose to receive messages through multiple addresses. For example, a client may choose to receive instant Updates through both an email address and by text to a telephone number.

This chart shows the number of messages Metro is sending out, per year, via the Instant Update product.
This chart depicts the number of clients signed up for Metro’s Instant Updates, regardless of how many addresses they choose. For example, if a client chooses to receive Instant Updates through both an email address and by text to a phone number, they will only count as one subscriber.

This chart shows the number of events and alerts addressed by Metro’s Instant Update product. Some events generate more than one message. For example, a road closure is an event that generated an initial alert and a follow-up alert when the road re-opens.
### Unique Subscribers vs. BUS Ridership
**FYE 2019**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Route Code</th>
<th>Subscribers</th>
<th>Ridership</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>79 - TONAWANDA EX</td>
<td>100,000</td>
<td>1,000,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>76 - LOTUS DAY CX</td>
<td>75,000</td>
<td>750,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>75 - WFSF/SNFCA FX</td>
<td>50,000</td>
<td>500,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>74 - HAMBURG EX</td>
<td>25,000</td>
<td>250,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>72 - ORCHARD PARK EX</td>
<td>10,000</td>
<td>100,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>70 - EAST AURORA EX</td>
<td>5,000</td>
<td>50,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>69 - ALDEN</td>
<td>2,500</td>
<td>25,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>68 - CLEVELAND HILL</td>
<td>2,000</td>
<td>20,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>67 - WILLIAMSVILLE EX</td>
<td>1,500</td>
<td>15,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>64 - LOCKPORT EX</td>
<td>1,000</td>
<td>10,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>61 - TONAWANDA CX</td>
<td>750</td>
<td>7,500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>60 - NIAGARA FALLS CX</td>
<td>500</td>
<td>5,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>55 - PINE AVE</td>
<td>250</td>
<td>2,500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>54 - MILITARY</td>
<td>200</td>
<td>2,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>52 - HYDE PARK</td>
<td>150</td>
<td>1,500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>50 - MAIN/NIAGARA</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>1,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>49 - MILLARD SUBURBAN</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>750</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>48 - WILLIAMSVILLE</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>47 - YOUNG'S ROAD</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>250</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>46 - LOCKPORT</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>150</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>42 - LACKAWANNA</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40 - GRAND ISLAND</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35 - SHERIDAN</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>34 - MAIN FALLS HWY</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32 - AMHERST</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29 - WOHLERS</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26 - DELAVAN</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25 - DELAWARE</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18 - FILLMORE/HERTEL</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16 - JEFFERSON</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14 - SOUTH PARK</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13 - SENECA</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14 - ADDOTT</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13 - KENMORE</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12 - UTICA</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11 - COVIN</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>09 - MAIN</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>07 - DAYNCS/RICIMOND</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>06 - SYRACUSE</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>05 - NIAGARA/KENMORE</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>04 - BROADWAY</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>03 - GRANT</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>02 - CLINTON</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>01 - WILLIAM</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CUSTOMER COMMENDATIONS & COMPLAINTS
Customers are encouraged to comment on their experience using Metro. These comments are documented as either Commendations or Complaints.
CUSTOMER COMPLAINTS BY TYPE

Customer complaints are delineated by the specific issues of Professionalism, Service Delivery or Equipment encountered and then reported by category for further evaluation and resolution.
Customer Relations

CUSTOMER COMPLAINTS BY STATION

Complaints per 100,000 Riders by Station

- Dabcock: FYE 2015 - 2.83, FYE 2016 - 1.14
- Cold Spring: FYE 2017 - 2.84, FYE 2018 - 1.35
- Frontier: FYE 2019 - 3.79

Image of a bus stop with people waiting and a bus.
CUSTOMER SATISFACTION SURVEYS

The American Bus Benchmarking Group (ABBG) and the Group of North American Light Rail Systems (GOAL) through the Imperial College, London, England, also conduct Customer Satisfaction Surveys on behalf of each member transit agency. Only two years of information is available due to GOAL starting surveys in 2017.

The following section shows a graphical presentation of how our riders perceive Metro’s Bus and Rail operations. Where the questions are similar in nature, both charts are displayed. The bus evaluations charts are colored in beige and the rail evaluations charts colored in blue.
CUSTOMER SATISFACTION SURVEYS

If there are problems, I can easily get information about alternative routes or schedules

- Strongly Agree
- Agree
- Neutral
- Disagree
- Strongly Disagree

2014 □ □ □ □ □ 2015 □ □ □ □ □ 2016 □ □ □ □ □ 2017 □ □ □ □ □ 2018 □ □ □ □ □

If there are disruptions, I can easily get useful information about options to complete my journey

- Strongly Agree
- Agree
- Neutral
- Disagree
- Strongly Disagree

2017 Rail □ □ □ □ □ 2018 Rail □ □ □ □ □

Bus drivers are helpful and professional

- Strongly Agree
- Agree
- Neutral
- Disagree
- Strongly Disagree

2014 □ □ □ □ □ 2015 □ □ □ □ □ 2016 □ □ □ □ □ 2017 □ □ □ □ □ 2018 □ □ □ □ □
CUSTOMER SATISFACTION SURVEYS

Bus drivers look professional (appropriate uniform & neat)

- Strongly Agree
- Agree
- Neutral
- Disagree
- Strongly Disagree

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>2014</th>
<th>2015</th>
<th>2016</th>
<th>2017</th>
<th>2018</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Strongly Agree</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agree</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neutral</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disagree</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strongly Disagree</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

I feel safe riding on the bus

- Strongly Agree
- Agree
- Neutral
- Disagree
- Strongly Disagree

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>2014</th>
<th>2015</th>
<th>2016</th>
<th>2017</th>
<th>2018</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Strongly Agree</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agree</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neutral</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disagree</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strongly Disagree</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

I feel secure on the trains

- Strongly Agree
- Agree
- Neutral
- Disagree
- Strongly Disagree

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>2017 Rail</th>
<th>2018 Rail</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Strongly Agree</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agree</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neutral</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disagree</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strongly Disagree</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Customer Relations

CUSTOMER SATISFACTION SURVEYS

**It is easy to find out if the buses are running on schedule**

- Strongly Agree
- Agree
- Neutral
- Disagree
- Strongly Disagree

[Bar chart showing data for 2014 to 2018]

**It is easy to find real-time service status information**

- Strongly Agree
- Agree
- Neutral
- Disagree
- Strongly Disagree

[Bar chart showing data for 2017 Rail and 2018 Rail]

**It is convenient to pay the bus fare / buy tickets or passes**

- Strongly Agree
- Agree
- Neutral
- Disagree
- Strongly Disagree

[Bar chart showing data for 2014 to 2018]
CUSTOMER SATISFACTION SURVEYS

It is convenient to pay for my journey (tickets or passes)

- Strongly Agree
- Agree
- Neutral
- Disagree
- Strongly Disagree

2017 Rail
2018 Rail

The bus is clean

- Strongly Agree
- Agree
- Neutral
- Disagree
- Strongly Disagree

2014
2015
2016
2017
2018

The trains are clean and comfortable

- Strongly Agree
- Agree
- Neutral
- Disagree
- Strongly Disagree

2017 Rail
2018 Rail
CUSTOMER SATISFACTION SURVEYS

The transit agency is responsive to customer complaints/problems

- Strongly Agree
- Agree
- Neutral
- Disagree
- Strongly Disagree

2014 2015 2016 2017 2018

The transit agency is responsive to customer complaints / problems

- Strongly Agree
- Agree
- Neutral
- Disagree
- Strongly Disagree

2017 Rail 2018 Rail
REVENUE
Revenue primarily consists of passenger fares and operating assistance from local, State and Federal sources. Other revenue consists of advertising fees and miscellaneous revenues. Passengers’ fares make up approximately 28% of total revenues.
Financial

REVENUE

Revenue Sources

Average Fare per Passenger

Metro Bus
$1.46
$1.55
Metro Rail
$1.11
$1.11
Paratransit Vans
$2.34
$2.88
EXPENSES

Expenses include personal services, maintenance & repairs, transit fuel & power, utilities, insurance and injuries, safety & security, general business & support services. Personal Services account for approximately 70% of all operational expenses.
METRO PASS SALES
Metro Passes are distributed through a variety of sources providing alternatives for customer access to pass media. These sources include:

- On bus
- MTC (downtown bus terminal)
- TVM (Ticket Vending Machines)
  - Rail stations
  - Bus transit centers
- Agencies\retail outlets\Metro website

**Point of Sale**
Five-Year Average

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Point of Sale</th>
<th>FYE 2015</th>
<th>FYE 2016</th>
<th>FYE 2017</th>
<th>FYE 2018</th>
<th>FYE 2019</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>On Bus</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1,000,048</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TVM</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>998,008</td>
<td></td>
<td>1,000,048</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MTC</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>524,827</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agencies/Outlets/Online</td>
<td></td>
<td>16,559</td>
<td></td>
<td>123,020</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Single-Ride Pass Sold on Bus**

**One-Day Pass**
METRO PASS SALES

**Multi-Day Pass**

- **7 Day Pass**
  - FYE 2015: 13,382
  - FYE 2016: 14,205
  - FYE 2017: 14,205
  - FYE 2018: 6,828
  - FYE 2019: 6,810

- **30 Day Pass**
  - FYE 2015: 117,663
  - FYE 2016: 111,540
  - FYE 2017: 111,540
  - FYE 2018: 23,841
  - FYE 2019: 23,077

**Monthly Pass**

- **Full Fare**
  - FYE 2015: 13,382
  - FYE 2016: 14,205
  - FYE 2017: 14,205
  - FYE 2018: 6,828
  - FYE 2019: 6,810

- **Half Fare**
  - FYE 2015: 117,663
  - FYE 2016: 111,540
  - FYE 2017: 111,540
  - FYE 2018: 23,841
  - FYE 2019: 23,077

**Paratransit Pass**

- **PAL Pass - 10 Ride**
  - FYE 2015: 2,321
  - FYE 2016: 2,378
  - FYE 2017: 2,378
  - FYE 2018: 6,405
  - FYE 2019: 6,754

- **PAL Pass - 20 Ride**
  - FYE 2015: 2,321
  - FYE 2016: 2,378
  - FYE 2017: 2,378
  - FYE 2018: 6,405
  - FYE 2019: 6,754
FUEL COSTS
In order to maintain budget stability and minimize costs, Metro may lock in fuel purchases for a portion of consumption. Metro fuel costs are based on the total volume purchased at both the market rate and fixed rate for the associated quantities. Market cost for fuel is based on the total cost that would be expended if we were to purchase our entire consumption at the market rate.
PERSONNEL

Improved attendance reliability lessens the Personal Services costs associated with absenteeism. Unscheduled absences can occur for illness, personal or emergency situation for which staffing adjustments are required and may necessitate overtime expenditures.

![Attendance Chart]

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>FYE 2015</th>
<th>FYE 2016</th>
<th>FYE 2017</th>
<th>FYE 2018</th>
<th>FYE 2019</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mechanics</td>
<td>94.2%</td>
<td>94.9%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Operators</td>
<td>91.3%</td>
<td>91.6%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Financial

### PERSONNEL

#### Years of Bus Driving Experience

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>0 - 5 yrs</th>
<th>6 - 10 yrs</th>
<th>11 - 20 yrs</th>
<th>21 - 30 yrs</th>
<th>31+ yrs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2018</td>
<td>45.1%</td>
<td>17.7%</td>
<td>31.2%</td>
<td>1.0%</td>
<td>0.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2017</td>
<td>36.5%</td>
<td>20.1%</td>
<td>34.7%</td>
<td>5.0%</td>
<td>4.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2016</td>
<td>28.9%</td>
<td>22.4%</td>
<td>36.4%</td>
<td>5.3%</td>
<td>8.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2015</td>
<td>21.2%</td>
<td>24.1%</td>
<td>39.3%</td>
<td>6.9%</td>
<td>8.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2014</td>
<td>12.8%</td>
<td>25.5%</td>
<td>43.7%</td>
<td>8.2%</td>
<td>9.9%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
COLLISIONS

Metro operators drive over 10,000,000 miles every year in the service area. Operating the fleet, subject to various weather and road conditions, will inevitably result in some vehicle collisions. Safe driver training techniques and mechanical soundness of the vehicles allow Metro to maintain a very low collision rate.
COLLISIONS

Collision Rate per 100,000 Miles
Fixed Route

Collision Rate per 100,000 Miles
Fixed Route

FYE 2015  FYE 2016  FYE 2017  FYE 2018  FYE 2019

FYE 2015  FYE 2016  FYE 2017  FYE 2018  FYE 2019

Apr  May  Jun  Jul  Aug  Sep  Oct  Nov  Dec  Jan  Feb  Mar

FYE 2015  FYE 2016  FYE 2017  FYE 2018  FYE 2019
WORKPLACE

Personal injuries have a direct impact on Metro’s ability to provide reliable, cost effective service. Regular monitoring, reporting and evaluating injuries are critical to maintaining operations and protecting our employees.

Each month, the most predominant personal injuries are reviewed by the Executive Director and top levels of Metro management. Through their analysis, the injury root causes are discussed, and recommendations are developed to keep employee safety a high priority within Metro.
Safety/Environment

WORKPLACE

Three is key! Use three points of contact to prevent unwanted impact.

Safety From start to finish

Lemar Robinson
18 years of service
Mechanic #1 - Cold Spray Body Shop

Your 10 Best Tools
Take care of them!

Jessica Maldonado
7 years of service
Bus Operator - Babcock Station

Buckle. Drive. Stay alive.
CARBON FOOTPRINT

Many considerations go into being a good community neighbor. The effect on the atmosphere due to emissions, the disposal of our waste products, the recycling of our motor oils and solid wastes and the energy consumed by our facilities' operations are all areas that Metro monitors to find effectiveness and efficiency in the operations.

The following charts represent Metro’s efforts in reduction of the carbon footprint of our revenue service fleet.

![System Vehicles Carbon Footprint Chart]

- FYE 2019: 17.06 TONS
  - Metro System Diesel CO2: 2.00 TONS
  - Metro System Gasoline Vans CO2: 6.73 TONS

- FYE 2018: 19.06 TONS
  - Metro System Diesel CO2: 1.93 TONS
  - Metro System CNG Vehicles CO2: 5.73 TONS
What does the future hold for Metro and its riders?

- New fare collection system with more flexibility and greater access for rider convenience
- Continued transparency and accountability through the annual Metro Performance Report
- New buses powered by alternative fuel sources
- Connecting Metro with its customers using social media
- Rebuilding and modernizing the entire rail car fleet
- Technology enhancements for improved customer communications
- Next generation Metro Bus corridors (Niagara Street)
- Analysis of transit alternatives to support community development
- Develop partnerships and marketing strategies to improve revenue and service

Come ride with us!
Our Future

Metro Rail Extension

DL&W Train Station

Division Street Bus Canopy

METGO - our new fare collection system